PacificHydro

12 October 2011

Suzanne Frame

General Manager Development
Independent Market Operator
PO Box 7096

Cloisters Square
PERTH WA 6850

By email: troy.forward@imowa.com.au

Dear Ms Frame

Re: IMO Board ' s proposed decision to accept RC _2010_25, as modified following the first submission period

Pacific Hydro (PH) is a wholly Australian owned renewable energy company that has been successfully developing and operating renewable energy assets for over 20 years. Through our owners, Industry Funds Management, approximately 5 million Australians are shareholders in our company.

Within Western Australia Pacific Hydro owns and operates the 30MW Ord Hydro power station located in the East Kimberley region. We also own a number of wind farms and hydro assets on the eastern seaboard. While PH does not currently have an operational plant in the South West Interconnected System (SWIS), we are in the latter stages of developing a large scale SWIS connected wind farm. As such, we are keenly interested in the proposed rule change.

Pacific Hydro has been an active member of the IMO'S Renewable Energy Generation Group since April 2009. This working group has considered the proposed rule changes covered by this submission.

Investment in wind power is more efficiently brought forward in the SW IS when the market arrangements are equitable and provide revenue predictability. First and foremost generators should be fairly remunerated for the underlying capacity they provide. Wind, despite being intermittent, can and does provide reliable capacity. With this in mind capacity payments have historically represented a reasonably predictable and stable cash flow and have been equitable. Any change to the current methodology has the potential to have a disproportionate impact on project financing and delivery.

Given the importance of certainty over price and simplicity over complexity PH supports the original proposal developed by McLennan Magasanik Associates (MMA) in January 2010. In our opinion the MMA approach was based on a systematic and well-resourced study and their methodology delivered credible and stable results.

Pacific Hydro Pty Ltd ABN 31 057 279 508
Level 11, 474 Flinders Street Melbourne Victoria 3000 Australia I Telephone +61 3 8621 6000 1 Facsimile +61 3 8621 6111 I pacitichydia.com.au

PacificHydro

Please note that the MMA January 2010 proposal referred to above was not adopted by either the IMO or Griffin Energy under the Rule Change Proposals RC_2010_25 (IMO) and RC_2010_37 (Griffin Energy) and so in our previous submission on this issue (4 February) we were recommending no change to the existing rule.

It is also worth noting System Management's concerns around the 2010 MMA proposal - in particular that the MMA methodology delivers capacity values above 35% of rated output for wind farms that showed good correlation to system demand. We understand System Management prefers that the maximum capacity that should be awarded to wind energy is capped at 20% of rated output. While we hold a different view, we accept that System Management has a clear view on this issue based on operating experience.

In light of the clear rejection of the preferred MMA proposal, and in the interests of alleviating System Management's concerns and assisting the IMO Board resolve this issue, Pacific Hydro can support the methodology proposed in the Sapare Report, subject to the following changes:

1. Modelling should include Collgar Wind Farm within the Sapare methodology (thereby
allowing industry to consider the impacts);

2. Provide greater certainty and transparency around the formulation and setting of the
adjustment factors; and

3. Change the methodology to use Operational Load instead of Load for Scheduled
Generators when considering trade intervals.

These are discussed in more detail in the attachment to this letter.

In our view, unless the proposed changes are made, the rule change currently under consideration will result in an unfair bias against investment in renewable energy technologies.

Successful new wind farm developments of scale will require a bankable off-take agreement from a retailer. The retailer will pay a bundled price for the output of the wind farm which includes the energy, the capacity credits and renewable energy certificates.

Energy and certificates form a predictable part of the bundle. However, the lack of transparency in the proposed methodology and subsequent lack of predictability around the capacity payments will result in a limited retail market for wind generated energy.

It is our opinion that accepting RC_2010_25 as modified by the Sapare Report is not consistent with the overall market objective of avoiding discrimination in the market against particular energy options such as intermittent wind facilities.

Yours sincerely

^ ^-^ I^1---^--
John Vendel
Market Operations Manager
Pacific Hydro Australia

Pacific Hydro Pty Ltd ABN 31 057 279 508
Level 11, 474 Flinders Street Melhourne Victoria 3000 Australia I Telephone +61 3 8621 6000 1 Facsimile +61 3 8691 6111 1 pacifichydro.com .m j

$^PacificHydro

For enquiries regarding this letter, please contact: John Vendel

jvendel@pacifichydro.com.au
Tel. 03 8621 6380

Pacific Hydro Pty Ltd ABN 31 057 279 508
Level 11. 474 Finders Street Melbourne Victoria 3000 Australia I Telephone +61 3 8621 6000 1 Facsimile +61 3 8621 6111 1 pacifichydro.com.au

v

PacificHydro

PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE METHODOLOGY PROPOSED IN THE
SAPARE REPORT

1. Include Collgar Wind Farm

The IMO Board's proposed modified rule change is heavily influenced by the recommendations contained in the Sapare Report (Capacity value of intermittent generation: August 2011). The Sapare report did not consider the impact of the Collgar wind farm in its modelling. This is causing concern within the renewable energy industry as it is believed that the inclusion of the Collgar data will have a material impact on the modelled outcomes.

The Sapare report should be updated to include the Collgar projected generation outputs (calculated using historic wind speed data sets that will accurately determine the historic generation at outputs over the peak periods covered in the report). Subsequent to this, industry should be granted time to review the new results before the IMO take a decision.

Key reasons why the Sapare report should be updated include:

• Collgar wind farm is now operational and the most dominant wind farm going forward. Collgar

PacificHydro

heavily discounted by potential investors. Wind farm developers need to be able to build a transparent capacity payment methodology into their models for two reasons:

(A) At the development stage, it will help determine whether a wind farm is economically
viable or whether another option should be pursued;

(B) Once operating, it will enable the generator to check the accuracy of the capacity
payments they are receiving.

It is recommended that the adjustment factors contained in the proposed methodology be formulated in a way that allow them to be replicated going forward.

3. Use of operational load instead of load for scheduled generators

Operational Load is preferred over the Load for Scheduled Generators (LSG) that is used in the Sapare report as discussed below.

It appears that the LSG methodology acts to remove from the calculation high demand intervals when the intermittent fleet is operating at high capacity while keeping intervals of when the intermittent plant has low output. This acts to introduce an inherent bias against intermittent generation.

The LSG methodology was introduced by MMA to reduce volatility however there is no confidence that this remains the case with detailed modelling undertaken by industry participants using their operational data seeing that volatility remains in the methodology.

Furthermore the LSG concept to the Rules as LSG is unique to this calculation with no historic data (unlike Operational Load which is the Market standard and well documented) and so introduces another layer of complexity and uncertainty to the Market Rules.

Pacific Hydro Pty Ltd ABN 31 057 279 508
Level 11. 474 Flinders Street Melbourne Victoria 3000 Australia I Telephone +61 3 8621 6000 1 Facsimile +61 3 8621 6111 1 pacifichydro.com.au